

To: Kathy Glennan, Chair, RDA Steering Committee

Cc: Linda Barnhart, RSC Secretary; Renate Behrens, Chair Elect

From: Ahava Cohen, EURIG Representative

Subject: Response to RSC/TranslationsTLO/2022/1

Proposal for correction of the narrower element hierarchy in Manifestation: manufacturer agent (etc.) and its inverses

After consultation with the EURIG Editorial Committee:

There was a minority response (included in the feedback from UK CoR) that the original intent of 'manufacturer' included all parts and process used in the (potential) manufacture of a manifestation and that clarifying this in the definitions should be enough.

In general, there is a concern that the specialist and rare materials communities have not been sufficiently consulted though they are likely to be the groups most affected.

**Recommendation #1: Correct the broader element and some definitions for book designer agent and its inverses**

I support the change, including the proposed change of broader element to 'creator agent of manifestation' as proposed by the TTLO.

Note that the word "entire" in the definitions is problematic as the book design may be a collaborative effort by two or more agents.

*In the group of recommendations 2-4 UKCoR suggests adding a scope note:*

*"Products and materials consumed in the manufacture of published manifestations are not themselves considered to be published manifestations."*

**Recommendation #2: Correct the broader element for papermaker agent and its inverses.**

I support the change, including the proposed change of broader element to 'creator agent of manifestation' as proposed by the TTLO.

I also support the definition change as modified by the TTLO: 'making' is at once broader than 'production' and can be modified more easily by policies to exclude commercial production of paper, if so desired by the cataloguing agency.

**Recommendation #3: Correct the broader element and some definitions for platemaker agent and its inverses.**

I support the change, including the proposed change of broader element to 'creator agent of manifestation' as proposed by the TTLO.

I also support the definition change as modified by the TTLO: 'making' is at once broader than 'production' and can be used in creation of metadata for communities which do not necessarily endorse 'inscription, fabrication, construction, or other method' as production. One member of the EURIG Editorial Committee did ask why platemakers need only prepare the plates and not actually make them, as implied in their very name.

**Recommendation #4: Correct the broader element and some definitions for printmaker agent and its inverses.**

I support the change, including the proposed change of broader element to 'creator agent of manifestation' as proposed by the TTLO.

**Recommendation #5: Correct the broader element and some definitions for collotyper agent and its inverses.**

Support. Is the use of the term 'used to make a print' there only for grammatical needs (to support the rest of the sentence)? As collotyper would be under the broader element 'printmaker X', of course their work goes toward making prints.

**Recommendation #6: Correct the broader element and some definitions for engraver agent and its inverses.**

Support. Is the end of the definition ('used for printing') necessary? For one thing, the engraving may be meant for printing but in the end not used (and later catalogued as part of a special collection) and for another, as part of the broader element 'printmaker X', of course their work is intended for making prints.

**Recommendation #7: Correct the broader element and some definitions for etcher agent and its inverses.**

Support. Is the end of the definition ('used for printing') necessary? For one thing, the etching may be meant for printing but in the end not used (and later catalogued as part of a special collection) and for another, as part of the broader element 'printmaker X', of course their work is intended for making prints.

**Recommendation #8: Correct the broader element and some definitions for lithographer agent and its inverses**

Support, though 'preparing a stone of plate for lithographic printing' would be more inclusive if it were 'intended for lithographic printing' (which would then also be even if the plate wasn't actually used in the manifestation).